

EXHIBIT A

THE LEADER IN ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT NEWS

NATIONAL MONUMENTS

Threats of violence, fake land grabs proliferate in Utah

Phil Taylor, E&E News reporter

Published: Friday, June 10, 2016

Bears Ears are a pair of buttes located in the southeastern portion of Utah. Photo by J. Brew, courtesy of Flickr.

One flier advertises an open hunting season on southeast Utah backpackers, with no harvest limits and all weapons permitted.

Another carries a fake news release from Interior Secretary Sally Jewell: The federal government plans to seize more than 4 million acres of the Navajo Nation's land.

A third flier advertises a July 17 party in Blanding, Utah, to celebrate President Obama's designation of a Bears Ears National Monument that would supposedly happen that day. But Utah Navajos aren't invited, the flier states. They can kiss access to their sacred lands goodbye.

"Utah Navajos, stay away from our party," it reads. "Everyone else come and celebrate with us."

The postings discovered in the past month at trailheads, campgrounds, a post office and gas stations in San Juan County show that the debate surrounding the proposed 1.9-million-acre national monument is getting nasty.



Conservationists reported finding this flier at a trailhead on Cedar Mesa, which President Obama is considering preserving as a national monument.

Photo courtesy of Ballots Not Bullets.

It's not clear who posted them and whether they come from the same person or different authors.

"I think they're repulsive, and whoever generates them should not be rewarded," said County Commissioner Phil Lyman, who opposes a Bears Ears monument and in April served a 10-day jail sentence for leading an illegal all-terrain vehicle ride in Recapture Canyon to protest federal land restrictions.

Monument proponents suspect anti-monument activists posted the fliers to foment discord among Navajos, whose elected leaders firmly back the Bears Ears proposal. Roughly 47 percent of San Juan's 15,772 residents are American Indian, most of them Navajo.

The flier promoting the killing of backpackers does not mention Bears Ears, but conservationists said it's hard to ignore the connection.

"The timing of it seems pretty obvious," said Josh Ewing, executive director of Friends of Cedar Mesa, a nonprofit based in Bluff, Utah, near the southeast border of the proposed monument. "It's a serious issue."

Cynthia Wilson, a community outreach coordinator for Utah Diné Bikéyah, a Navajo environmental group that helped design the Bears Ears proposal, called the tactics "despicable

and likely criminal."

Chilcoat / Franklin Amicus Exhibits

E-002

"This is a clear attempt to turn people against a Bears Ears National Monument by spreading lies, inciting racism and impersonating federal officials," she said.

Lyman had another theory about the fliers.

"I think Diné Bikéyah is generating them," he said. "They post it and say, 'Look, there's racism, and it justifies a national monument.' That sentiment doesn't exist here."

Few in San Juan disagree that enhanced protections are needed for the Bears Ears region, which includes Cedar Mesa, a scenic expanse of juniper and pinyon forests, winding sandstone canyons, and an estimated 100,000 archaeological sites, including Native American cliff dwellings, rock art and burial pits.

But there's a deep divide over how much of the landscape to preserve and whether those protections should come from Congress or from Obama using the Antiquities Act. A draft bill by House Natural Resources Chairman Rob Bishop (R-Utah) and Rep. Jason Chaffetz (R-Utah) would designate a 1.1-million-acre Bears Ears National Conservation Area, leaving far more acreage available to multiple uses like drilling, mining and motorized recreation.

The Bears Ears Inter-Tribal Coalition, a partnership of the Hopi, Navajo, Uintah and Ouray Ute, Ute Mountain Ute, and Zuni governments, backs a presidential designation, though there are at least several Utah Navajos who oppose such a move, including San Juan Commissioner Rebecca Benally. Yesterday, the Utah Tribal Leaders group passed a formal resolution of support for a Bears Ears National Monument. Official representatives from seven of Utah's eight tribes have backed the proposal, UDB said. The resolution was opposed by May Preston, president of the San Juan Southern Paiute Tribe.

Jewell is planning to visit Utah this summer to discuss conservation proposals -- both legislative and otherwise -- and Bears Ears is widely assumed to be on her agenda.

Use of the Antiquities Act touches raw nerves in southern Utah, where elected officials still fume over President Clinton's surprise 1996 election-year decision to designate the 1.7-million-acre Grand Staircase-Escalante National Monument, a move that quashed a proposed coal mine and drew accusations of federal overreach.

In subsequent years, elected officials and ranchers openly flouted new Bureau of Land Management restrictions. Kane County erected dozens of road signs allowing motorized travel on monument lands that BLM had closed to protect sensitive desert resources. In 2000, after BLM impounded dozens of cattle to protect the range from drought, ranchers stealthily stole the bovines back from the auction yard.

Armed protests 'a possibility'

Conservationists and Southwest tribes want a Bears Ears monument, but some are fearful of the blowback new land protections would generate, particularly in light of the recent armed occupation of the Malheur National Wildlife Refuge in Oregon.

Sen. Orrin Hatch (R-Utah), who in early June hosted an event with Gov. Gary Herbert (R) at the Natural Bridges National Monument to denounce the Bears Ears monument proposal, warned Jewell in a private meeting in his office on March 8 that a repeat of Clinton's monument could prompt an armed confrontation, according to an [article](#) in *The Washington Post*.

Bishop, when asked yesterday if a monument could spark armed protests in Utah, said, "If you keep refusing to listen to people, it's always a possibility.

"It would be the dumbest thing the administration could ever do," Bishop said. "The Native Americans who live there don't want it."

Fliers calling for the shooting of backpackers have heightened tensions.

One of the fliers was discovered May 31 by Vaughn Hadenfeldt, a board member of Friends of Cedar Mesa, at the Slickrock Trail, a gateway to cliff dwellings, pictographs and petroglyphs, Ewing said.

It reads, "Colorado Backpacker Season," and is purportedly sponsored by the Protect San Juan County Association, an organization that does not appear to exist.

"There is no limit on how many may be harvested," it says. "Any weapon may be used."

The friends group has discovered the flier at other trailheads and has taken them down, but someone is putting them back up, Ewing said. Utah Diné Bikéyah reported finding the flier at BLM's Sand Island campground along the San Juan River southwest of Bluff.

"I believe that the BLM is taking this seriously," Ewing said. "It's been referred to their agents in Salt Lake City."

The flier misrepresents county residents, he said.



The flier advertising a party for Bears Ears -- Utah Navajos are not invited -- was found at the Bluff post office and a gas station, according to Utah Diné Bikéyah (UDB). Photo courtesy of UDB.

"The San Juan County residents I know are a much more peaceful, civil lot than what's depicted on that flier," Ewing said. "We sometimes disagree, but we almost always disagree civilly."

Criminal acts

Interior spokeswoman Jessica Kershaw encouraged people to report knowledge of this activity or the location of any fliers to BLM so that they may be removed.

"It's really unfortunate and disappointing when a single person or small group of individuals behaves this way, trying to incite fear to bully their way through an ongoing conversation about the management and conservation of public lands," Kershaw said.

Wilson of UDB discovered the fake Jewell press release and invitation to the Bears Ears event in Mexican Hat -- on the northern border of the Navajo Nation -- and Bluff on May 22.

The Jewell release says 4 million acres of reservation lands will "revert" to the BLM.

Interior confirmed that the release is fake and said impersonating a federal official is punishable by up to three years in prison.

The Bears Ears flier advertises a party hosted by UDB and promises "Lots of good food" from the Southern Utah Wilderness Alliance, Great Old Broads for Wilderness and Friends of Cedar Mesa.

"No Utah Navajos are invited because we in Window Rock [the Navajo Nation capital] are taking your sacred land and stopping your wood cutting and other activities on this land and you have been complaining about that," it says. "Window Rock is also going to take your oil money to spend in Window Rock."

UDB said another fake letter accompanied the flier in some locations. Falsely signed by Albert Holiday, vice president of the Navajo Nation's Oljato Chapter, it warns that a monument would block Navajo access to the land to gather firewood and medicinal herbs and perform sacred activities. Holiday said he supports the monument and did not write it.

If history is any indication, it is unlikely Obama would take steps to ban such activities in a Bears Ears monument.

The president has thus far made no attempts to restrict traditional uses like grazing and tribal activities within the dozens of monuments he has proclaimed.

In his March 25, 2013, [proclamation](#) designating the 243,000-acre Río Grande del Norte National Monument in northern New Mexico, for example, he protected tribal uses, writing, "Nothing in this proclamation shall be construed to preclude the traditional collection of firewood and piñon nuts in the monument for personal non-commercial use consistent with the purposes of this proclamation."

Reporter Corbin Hiar contributed.



This fake news release from Interior Secretary Sally Jewell was found at the Bluff post office, according to UDB. Photo courtesy of UDB.

Email: ptaylor@eenews.net

Advertisement

The essential news for energy & environment professionals

© 1996-2018 Environment & Energy Publishing, LLC [Privacy Policy](#) [Site Map](#) [Contact Us](#)

EXHIBIT B

High Country News

FOR PEOPLE WHO CARE ABOUT THE WEST

Fear and loathing in San Juan County

Stephanie Paige Ogburn | Oct. 8, 2012

Last weekend, one, two, or maybe many anti-wilderness advocates in San Juan County, Utah, decided that freedom of speech wasn't good enough for them. They felt so desperate to be heard that they turned into criminals, using vandalism and threats to amplify their voices.

The target of this criminal rage? A group of elderly women. That group is called Great Old Broads for Wilderness (<http://greatoldbroads.org/>). The organization is primarily composed of "old and gray" people, (mostly women) and its mission is to advocate and educate on behalf of the environment. Great Old Broads has twice-yearly campouts in various locales, called "Broadwalks," where they conduct educational hikes and bring in speakers to discuss environmental issues and advocacy campaigns in that area. During the last weekend in September, about 50 "Broads" gathered in southeast Utah's canyon country, a few miles outside the Needles District of Canyonlands National Park.



A member of the Great Old Broads for Wilderness listens to a scientific presentation about the importance of soil crust in minimizing erosion during their recent Broadwalk in Utah's canyonlands.

On the evening of September 28 the group was vandalized. On the night of September 29 they received threatening messages and were locked into their campsite, an action that put their safety at risk.

The Broads were camping on private property, the Nature Conservancy's Dugout Ranch, which is surrounded by Bureau of Land Management land. In order to get to the campsite, one had to turn off the main road into the Needles district, drive down a BLM road, and then go through a private gate and drive into the camp. The Broads, as they are often called, had hung their vinyl banner on the gate to let members know where to turn. On the first evening of vandalism, the banner was slashed and spray-painted. The Broads took it in stride, making jokes about San Juan County residents picking on a bunch of grandmothers and "little old ladies."



Vandalism from Friday evening, cutting through the Great Old Broads banner.

On Sunday morning, a member of the group who awoke very early to leave the campsite and return to work found the exit gate padlocked shut and an old hag Halloween mask, doused in fake blood, hung in effigy on a fencepost nearby. Underneath the mask was a milk jug with the threat "Stay out of San Juan County. No last chance" inked onto it.



Veronica Egan, the executive director of Great Old Broads, then had to hike about a mile to the ranch house and find an employee with bolt cutters who could come cut the chain.

Closing off vehicle access out of a campsite is a threat to the safety of any group. When it happens to a group of elderly women, the risk is even greater.

"The last Broadwalk we were on we had two people that went to the hospital," says Rose Chilcoat, associate director at the organization. "Especially when you have that many people, you never know. It could have been a health issue; it could have been a fire. In my mind, it was as dangerous as if people had locked us into a house."

Egan, the executive director, says that unfortunately she expects her group to get picked on when they are in the Canyonlands area. This is not the first time residents of San Juan County have threatened the Broads.

Since 2006, Great Old Broads for Wilderness has been involved in what Egan calls the "saga" of an illegally constructed trail in the area, in Recapture Wash. The illegal trail allowed motorized access into archaeological sites, and in 2006 the Great Old Broads conducted monitoring of the construction, which included a bridge, culverts and rock cribbing, raising awareness within the BLM about the trail and threats to cultural resources. The following year, the route was closed, because of vandalism to the archaeological sites in the area. Such vandalism triggers automatic closures to motorized vehicles under the Archaeological Protection Act, but locals blamed the Broads.

"Someone in San Juan county thinks that we forced the BLM to close the trail," says Egan. "If only we could force the BLM to do anything!"

Since the closure, the Broads have been involved in a working group of stakeholders, including motorized users, discussing the future of the trail. In 2010, as the working group headed out to look at the area, they encountered numerous signs. The signs read:

"Wanted dead or alive: Members of Great Old Broads for Wilderness are not allowed in San Juan County Utah."



Just a day before the September Broadwalk, the main newspaper in the San Juan County town of Blanding, the weekly *Blue Mountain Panorama*, ran a two-page piece that let readers know exactly where the Broads were planning to camp. A line in the article reads: "The GOBs are coming, the GOBs are coming!" In the piece, members of the local ATV group, SPEAR (<http://www.spear4all.com/index.htm>), are encouraged to take "a field trip to the GOB's camp to take pictures, and listen to their BS, and smile at them. Perhaps an ATV parade (on existing trails near their campsite), with members of the GOBs Board of Directors as Grand Marshalls might be appropriate." The piece concludes "maybe we should keep an eye on them while they're here..."

It's unclear if this piece of writing was considered a news story, an editorial, or an advertisement. It lacks a byline, and two phone calls and an email to the editors of the weekly (which is not online) to clarify the piece, its author, and its intent, have gone unanswered.

What is clear is the article's inflammatory tone, and that it uses details from the Great Old Broads website to outline for readers where the group is camping -- a handy tool if you're an aspiring vandal.

[Blue Mountain Panorama 9-6-12 - Great Old Broads article](http://www.scribd.com/doc/109356083/Blue-Mountain-Panorama-9-6-12-Great-Old-Broads-article)
(<http://www.scribd.com/doc/109356083/Blue-Mountain-Panorama-9-6-12-Great-Old-Broads-article>)

BLUE MOUNTAIN PANORAMA THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 6, 2012 PAGE 5

The last time the Great Old Broads for Wilderness paid lots of attention to San Juan County, Utah, two Blanding residents were fined \$35,000 for improving a trail through Recapture Canyon, and they forced the BLM to close the entire area to ATV's.

Well, as one email from a member of San Juan Public Entry and Access Rights (SPEAR) warned, **"THE GOBS ARE COMING...THE GOBS ARE COMING!!!"** That's right. According to the GOB's publication on their website, they are planning the *Protect Greater Canyonlands Broadwalk - Sept 27-Oct 1, 2012*. Forewarned is forearmed I guess. SPEAR members are talking about a field trip to the GOB's camp to take pictures, and listen to their BS and smile at them. Perhaps an ATV parade (on existing trails near their campsite), with members of the GOB's Board of Directors as Grand Marshalls might be appropriate. According the GOB's website none of the Board of

al Park, Natural Bridges National Monument and the Manti-La Sal National Forest. There are also the necessary indications of ATV Threats to alert all those who believe ATV's will destroy the planet and especially the wilderness areas of the Colorado Plateau.

The GOB's are meeting at Indian Creek, near Monticello, and their agenda includes hikes, speakers (who

will no doubt describe the threats of mankind and OHV use to the area), service projects and more. Participation in the event was full back in February. The GOB's website describes The Greater Canyonlands Area as "a landscape of plateaus, stunning geologic formations, 10,000 year old archeological sites, and unmatched natural beauty — including iconic Utah land-

GOB's plan event to protect the Greater Canyonlands Area

marks such as Labyrinth Canyon, Indian Creek, White Canyon, Fiddler Butte, Dobbins

oil and gas development."

The only Utahns wanting

The Great Old Broads is not the only group experiencing hatred in San Juan County, which has long been known for its opposition to wilderness and management changes on public lands. Members of the federal government in charge of enforcing policies on public land have also experienced harassment from locals. *High Country News* is currently investigating this topic as well; if you have any information, please feel free to contact us.

While citizens of San Juan County are more than welcome to disagree with the positions taken by the Great Old Broads -- it's a free country, after all -- the manner in which they show their disapproval is cowardly and shameful. In such a beautiful part of the world, it's saddening to see such ugly actions.

Stephanie Paige Ogburn is the online editor at High Country News.

Images courtesy the author

Copyright © High Country News